

 GIG CYMRU NHS WALES Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru Public Health Wales	Name of Meeting Board Date of Meeting 26 January 2023 Agenda item 8.1:
--	--

External Review of the Llwynhendy Tuberculosis Outbreak

Executive lead:	Professor Fu-Meng Khaw, National Director of Health Protection and Screening Services and Executive Medical Director, Public Health Wales Professor Philip Kloer, Executive Medical Director, Deputy Chief Executive, Hywel Dda University Health Board
------------------------	--

Approval/Scrutiny route:	Llwynhendy TB outbreak External Review Joint Oversight Group 16 January 2023 PHW Business Executive Team 16 January 2023 PHW Health Protection and Screening Services Directorate Leadership Team 11 January 2023
---------------------------------	---

Purpose

The purpose of this paper is to provide the Boards of Public Health Wales (PHW) and Hywel Dda University Health Board (HDUHB) with the completed External Review Report into the management of the TB outbreak centred around Llwynhendy, Carmarthenshire, and to outline the findings and recommendations made by the external review panel. The paper also sets out the action plan for PHW and high-level action plan for HD UHB in response to the recommendations.

The report is the product of the external review of the management of the Llwynhendy Tuberculosis Outbreak incident for which the outline and Terms of Reference were presented to the meetings of PHW Board and HD UHB Board on 30th September 2021.

Recommendation:

APPROVE <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	CONSIDER <input type="checkbox"/>	RECOMMEND <input type="checkbox"/>	ADOPT <input type="checkbox"/>	ASSURANCE <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
--	--------------------------------------	---------------------------------------	-----------------------------------	--

PHW Board is asked to:

- **NOTE** the findings and recommendations final report of the external review
- **NOTE** the communications plan
- **NOTE** the HD UHB high-level action plan
- **APPROVE** the PHW action plan

Link to Public Health Wales [Strategic Plan](#)

Public Health Wales has an agreed strategic plan, which has identified seven strategic priorities and well-being objectives.

This report contributes to the following:

Strategic Priority/Well-being Objective	5 - Protecting the public from infection and environmental threats to health
--	--

Summary impact analysis

Equality and Health Impact Assessment	An Equality or Health Impact Assessment has not been undertaken.
Risk and Assurance	n/a
Health and Care Standards	This report supports and/or takes into account the Health and Care Standards for NHS Wales Quality Themes Theme 2 - Safe Care
Financial implications	There are no financial implications
People implications	There are no people implications

1. Purpose / situation

The purpose of this paper is to provide the Board with the completed External Review Report and to outline the findings and recommendations made by the external review panel. The paper also sets out the detailed action plan for PHW in response to the recommendations and it shares the high-level action plan for HDUHB.

The report is the product of the external review of the management of the Llwynhendy Tuberculosis Outbreak incident for which the outline and Terms of Reference were presented to the Board meeting on 30th September 2021. The report was jointly commissioned by PHW and HDUHB and the respective Executive Medical Directors were the joint Senior Responsible Officers for the review.

2. Background

On 9th November 2010, an outbreak investigation was initiated into a cluster of active Tuberculosis (TB) cases with the same genotype profile, occurring in the Llwynhendy area of Carmarthenshire. By the end of 2018, 29 (twenty-nine) cases (in 28 individuals) of active TB disease were linked to the outbreak.

In the intervening years, the outbreak investigation was re-opened and closed twice. In November 2018 the outbreak investigation was re-opened for the fourth time in response to new cases of TB. The outbreak control team was re-established and wider contact screening was carried out in the local community.

In 2019, a rapid internal review was carried out by PHW, to identify immediate actions and to make recommendations for the ongoing management of the outbreak. The findings of the internal review were presented to a Board Private Session (PHW) and an In-Committee Board meeting (HDUHB) and in November 2019. One of the key recommendations of the review was to commission, jointly between PHW and HDUHB, an external review of the outbreak and its management, to inform the approach to the management of TB disease in Wales. Both PHW and HDUHB Boards agreed to proceed with the external review.

In response to the COVID-19 pandemic, a decision was taken early in 2020 to pause the review. In June 2021, following a meeting with PHW, the Chief Executives of PHW and HDUHB agreed that the external review should be resumed at the earliest opportunity. The scope and revised terms of reference were presented to the September 2021 Public Board meetings of both PHW and HDUHB and were approved.

The purpose of the review is to examine:

- Whether the management of the outbreak since 2010 overall, and at each stage, was conducted in accordance with best practice guidance in place at the time of each phase of the outbreak (with reference to

national strategies, strategies in other parts of the UK, WHO guidance, plans, guidelines and organisational protocols and procedures)

- The effectiveness of the respective involvement of Public Health Wales and Hywel Dda University Health Board in the control of the outbreak and treatment of latent or active TB cases at each stage (including the current phase) including the people and financial resources provided by both organisations in response to the outbreak to prevent disease transmission and treat identified TB disease
- The governance arrangements (including reporting and escalation) for informing Teams and Boards of the outbreak and providing assurance to the Boards of each organisation
- A review of any reported cases of: 1. People identified over the course of the outbreak who have died where the death certificate identified that TB contributed to or caused the death, and 2. People that have developed active TB
- The effectiveness of any policy(ies) relevant to TB disease prevention, treatment and control including the management of outbreaks applicable in Wales in each phase of the outbreak and the reporting arrangements within Wales since the outbreak was first declared in 2010
- The effectiveness of external expert advice sought and obtained including liaison with other organisations, for example, Public Health England (and UK Health Security Agency from October 2021) or the British Thoracic Society.

The review should identify lessons learned and make recommendations to PHW and HDUHB for improvement. There may also be recommendations for other key stakeholders.

This External Review Report (Appendix A) provides the findings of the review team.

3. Description/Assessment

The review has been undertaken as part of the legal duty of candour for PHW and HDUHB and accordingly, the communication and dissemination of the findings has adopted an open and transparent approach.

The recommendations of the external review are:

- (1) The outbreak has not yet concluded and the high level of latent TB infection in the population implies further risk. This risk is heightened because the active disease in this population is

predominantly pulmonary and therefore more infectious. Although the level of active TB infection is low in West Wales, delayed presentation in unrecognised cases may lead to further outbreaks and deaths. The level of awareness amongst the public and their health care professionals must be therefore increased and maintained. This also applies to trainee health professionals.

- (2) Any future outbreaks should be overseen by PHW from the outset with a TB -specific standard operating procedure for the conduct and recording of outbreak management. The current SOP and OCT policy needs to be updated in this respect. The latter needs to be developed alongside modern data analysis and WGS typing so that outbreaks are identified and contained. Comprehensive contact networks of all cases should be recorded electronically and plotted with social network analyses undertaken to ensure links between cases are uncovered quickly and easily.
- (3) Funding should be identifiable ahead of time for outbreaks of infectious diseases so that such outbreaks can be managed in a timely and effective manner without the need for time-wasting discussion.
- (4) The local TB service has improved but still has inadequacies. In particular, cross-cover arrangements need to be in place for annual, sick and study leave in order to prevent delays in treatment. Pharmacy and administrative support needs improvement. Succession planning for the TB Specialist Nurse also needs to be clear.
- (5) At a national level, the Cohort Review Programme needs to be supported with adequate funding for each contributing health board.
- (6) Welsh Government should support both the Cohort Review Programme and the proposal for a National Service Specification that includes the development of a TB pathway to tackle delayed diagnosis (e.g. investigating cough lasting longer than three weeks).
- (7) Wales does not seem to be properly prepared for the challenges of new migrants, refugees, and the occurrence of future drug resistance. These factors should be included in a future TB plan supported and funded by Welsh Government.

The findings and recommendations made within the report will be taken forward and addressed by both PHW and HDUHB with support from external partners. The action plans will be respectively reported through the Quality,

Safety and Improvement Committee in PHW and the Quality, Safety & Experience Committee in HDUHB and reported back to Public Board on progress made. The action plan for PHW is contained within Appendix B. The outline action plan for HDUHB is contained within Appendix C.

A Communications Plan has been developed to communicate the findings and recommendations of the external review. This includes the production of bilingual resources including media statements to correspond with the discussion of the report at the Public Board meetings, together with a set of public-facing Frequently Asked Questions (FAQS).

As in November 2021, a specific action has been taken to write personally to individuals who were 'directly affected' by the review. The original list of individuals 'directly affected', which was approved by both Executive Medical Directors, has been re-examined as of 28 November 2022, resulting in a small number of additional individuals (who have now attended TB screening) being added to a revised line list, with some other minor changes also being made where appropriate e.g. to residential address details. A suite of letters has been prepared and these are being sent out to correspond with the public Board discussion. The letters advise individuals of and provide access to the publication of the review report. The letters also provide details of a dedicated 'call line' which has been established, should individuals wish to seek further information, together with contact details for 'Putting Things Right' teams.

A draft report was presented by the chair of the review panel to both Boards meeting in private session on 25th October 2022. Following this, both Executive Medical Directors met with the chair of the review panel and provided written feedback collated from Welsh Government, HDUHB and PHW.

The final report was issued by the review panel on 2nd December 2022.

Throughout the review period, regular meetings have been held jointly between PHW and HDUHB to monitor progress of the review and to ensure that the review panel was adequately supported in its work. An Review Oversight Group, jointly chaired by the Executive Medical Directors of PHW and HDUHB, approved the Communications and handling plans to support the publication and dissemination of the report. The PHW action plan was agreed with relevant staff in the Health Protection and Screening Services Directorate and approved by the Directorate Leadership Team.

Recommendation

PHW Board is asked to:

- **NOTE** the findings and recommendations final report of the external review
- **NOTE** the communications plan
- **NOTE** the outline action plan for HDUHB
- **DISCUSS** and **APPROVE** the PHW action plan