



 <p>GIG CYMRU NHS WALES   Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru Public Health Wales</p>	<p><b>Name of Meeting</b> Knowledge, Research and Information Committee <b>Date of Meeting</b> 6 June 2024 <b>Agenda item:</b> 3.5</p>
---	--

<b>AI in Health and Social Care</b>	
<b>Executive lead:</b>	Iain Bell, Director of Public Health Data, Knowledge and Research, Knowledge Directorate
<b>Author:</b>	Louisa Nolan, Head of Data Science

<b>Approval/Scrutiny route:</b>	This paper has already been shared with the Board, as an inter-meeting briefing note
---------------------------------	--

<p><b>Purpose</b></p> <p>This briefing paper is an update on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>the emerging priorities and workplan of the AI in Health and Social Care Commission and Working Group, and Public Health Wales' contribution to this.</li> </ul> <p>AI activities and plans in Public Health Wales.</p>
--

<b>Recommendation:</b>				
<p style="text-align: center;">APPROVE</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p style="text-align: center;">CONSIDER</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><input checked="" type="checkbox"/></p>	<p style="text-align: center;">RECOMMEND</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p style="text-align: center;">ADOPT</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></p>	<p style="text-align: center;">ASSURANCE</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/></p>
<p>The Committee is asked to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>note</b> the collaborative work underway across the health and social care system, and PHW's contribution to this.</li> <li><b>note</b> the workplans for AI in PHW</li> <li>offer feedback.</li> </ul>				

<p><b>Link to Public Health Wales <a href="#">Strategic Plan</a></b></p>	
<p>Public Health Wales has an agreed strategic plan, which has identified seven strategic priorities and well-being objectives.</p>	
<p>This report contributes to the following:</p>	
<b>Strategic Priority/Well-being Objective</b>	7 - Building and mobilising knowledge and skills to improve health and well-being across Wales



<b>Summary impact analysis</b>	
<b>Equality and Health Impact Assessment</b>	No Equality and Health Impact Assessment has been undertaken as a decision is not required by the Committee.
<b>Risk and Assurance</b>	Not identified as a risk on the Corporate Risk Register or Board Assurance Framework
<b>Health and Care Standards</b>	All themes
<b>Financial implications</b>	None
<b>People implications</b>	There are some implications around capability building



## Introduction

This paper is to update the Knowledge, Research and Information Committee (KRIC) on AI-related activities in the NHS in Wales and the role PHW is currently playing. It describes:

- the current priorities, workplan and progress of the AI in Health and Social Care Commission, and the Working Group, and Public Health Wales' involvement in this
- PHW's activities and plans related to AI, including what is in the IMTP 2024/5 to 2026/7
- next steps.

## Background

The AI Commission for Health and Social Care was established on 1 June 2023, to lead and develop the curation of a safe, but enabling, environment within which the use of AI can flourish and support the modernisation of Health and Social Care in Wales. It was put in place following a landscape review by Louisa Nolan of PHW on behalf of the Chairs of PHW, DHCW and HEIW.

The Commission is chaired by Mike Emery (Chief Digital Officer for Health and Care in Welsh Government) and has a wide range of members across health and social care and brings in expertise in AI and technology from Wales and beyond. The Commission sets the priorities for AI in health and social care in Wales. Public Health Wales is represented on the Commission by Iain Bell (Executive lead) and Nick Elliott (Non-executive lead). The secretariat is provided by Welsh Government and the Life Sciences Hub.

This Commission provides senior governance for the AI in Health and Social Care Working Group. The Working Group was set up in response to the landscape review the landscape review of AI in health and social care. This was led by Louisa Nolan in Public Health Wales in response to a commission from the Chairs of PHW, DHCW and HEIW and was completed in December 2023. The workplan of the Working Group and Commission build on the recommendations from the landscape review. The Working Group is chaired by Louisa Nolan, and has representation from across the health, social care, and technology landscape in Wales. The Working Group has a remit to progress AI-related activity through its members, and members' organisations.

The Commission does not have formal decision-making authority, beyond that which the individual contributing organisations have themselves. However, it does have a remit to advise Mike Emery as NHS Executive CDO, who in turn can advise the Minister. The Terms of Reference and list of members are included in the Annex.



## AI Commission update

The role of PHW on the Commission is to provide expertise, and to ensure that AI in public health is not neglected.

The initial task for the Commission has been to agree the priorities and workplan for 2024/5. The priorities have been informed by the initial landscape review from December 2023. They are:

- Priority 1 - Develop a Greater Understanding of Need
- Priority 2 - Mapping the Current Ecosystem
- Priority 3 - Enabling safe and Ethical AI

The most recent AI Commission was held as a symposium on March 26, 2024. There were some interesting talks, including on two AI tools implemented in NHS Wales, IBEX (prostate cancer diagnosis) and Brainomix (stroke image analysis). The rich discussion high-lighted the need to better understand corporate governance for AI and digital readiness, and for training for information governance leads in this emerging field. These will be picked up in the workplan.

The emerging workplan for 2024/25 is shown in Table 1. Some highlights are:

- Creating an engagement plan: implementing safe and effective AI into health and social care requires a wide range of stakeholders. Mapping those stakeholders, and understanding how and when to engage with them is key to the success of this work, to ensure buy-in
- Establishing an AI framework: the [AI and digital regulations service](#) is a collaboration between NICE, MHRA, CQC and the NHS Health Research Authority in England. It is currently under review by Welsh stakeholders with a view to adapting and adopting the framework for Wales, and potentially contributing to provision of the service in Wales
- Scaling up: an important goal for the Commission is to identify what we know already works, and then look to scale it up at pace across Wales
- Establishing an AI and automation community of practice for the Welsh public sector: the Centre for Digital Public Services have now established an AI and automation community of practice. The first Steering Group meeting was held in early March, and PHW are represented in the Group. The goal of the community is to support the Welsh public sector to confidently exploit the opportunities AI and automation offer in a responsible, ethical, inclusive, and safe way.
- Improving AI capability in health and social care: this is being taken forward jointly by HEIW (workforce) and DHCW (Digital, data and technology roles)

Funding for a dedicated team to support this work has been made available, and a small team now sit in the Life Science Hub. The workplan for this team is being drafted for agreement by the Working Group and AI Commission.



## PHW AI activities and plans

AI offers a range of opportunities for public health, for example, screening diagnosis assistance, automating clinical coding, predictive modelling and simulation, streamlining operational processes, and the use of wearables to monitor health and activity. To identify what PHW should be taking forward, we will 1. identify what works elsewhere, and what could be adopted, and 2. work across the organisation to understand the challenges where AI would offer a value-for-money solution.

We will bring suggestions and challenges to a Board development session in the autumn for discussion.

To implement our agreed IMTP priorities we will:

- Adopt the guidance and good practice emerging from the AI Commission and have developed PHW policies and procedures
- Develop a programme for AI that goes beyond the use in diagnostics and looks at how we can use the technology to improve public health.
- Lead a Board development session in Autumn 2024 on the opportunities for AI in PHW.

Current AI activities in PHW include:

- The use of AI in the development of a lung screening service is being explored.
- Data Science and Analysis Division are running a small project to explore the utility of ChatGPT4, a generative AI model, to assist with coding and data exploration. PHW is also part of the Microsoft Copilot pilot.
- PHW are contributing to the ICO consultation series on generative AI and data protection

## Next steps

- We will lead a Board development session on the opportunities for Ai in public health in Autumn 2024.
- We will explore opportunities for working with academia, as part of our Academic Strategy, including where we might be able to collaborate with [UKRI-funded AI research](#). AI Hubs.
- We will continue to work with stakeholders across the AI landscape in Wales, to progress the work of AI Commission.
- We will deliver a plan for automation and AI as part of the implementation of our Digital and Data Strategy.



GIG  
CYMRU  
NHS  
WALES

Iechyd Cyhoeddus  
Cymru  
Public Health  
Wales

The Committee is asked to:

- **note** the collaborative work underway across the health and social care system, and PHW's contribution to this.
- **note** the workplans for AI in PHW
- offer feedback.

*Table 1: the emerging workplan from the AI Commission. Items in red are not yet confirmed.*

Item	Benefit	Lead org	Linked Commission priority
Mapping of the AI ecosystem	Informing decision making	PHW / Life Sciences Hub	Priority 2 – Mapping the current ecosystem
Stakeholder mapping	Informing decision making	PHW / Life Sciences Hub	Priority 2 – Mapping the current ecosystem
AI Training for Health and Social Care staff	Skills development	HEIW / DHCW	Priority 3 – Enabling Safe and Ethical AI
Algorithmic Register for Health and Social Care	Transparency and equity	CDPS / Welsh Government	Priority 3 – Enabling Safe and Ethical AI
Communications and engagement plan	Transparency and equity	Welsh Government / Life Sciences Hub	Priority 2 – Mapping the current ecosystem
AI catalogue & procurement framework review	Implementation and Delivery		Priority 2 – Mapping the current ecosystem
Review of corporate processes & delivery in HBs	Regulatory assurance	NHS Executive	Priority 1 – Develop a greater understanding of need
Lessons learned from stroke AI – in depth discussion with that team	Informing decision making	NHS Executive / Welsh Government	Priority 1 – Develop a greater understanding of need
Clarified strategy for securing national funding and links to HE	Implementation and Delivery	Life Sciences Hub	Priority 1 – Develop a greater understanding of need
Resourced and delivered comms and engagement plan	Transparency and equity	Welsh Government / Life Sciences Hub	Priority 3 – Enabling Safe and Ethical AI
Health economic review of current AI solutions and deployment plan	Informing decision making	Welsh Government	Priority 1 – Develop a greater understanding of need
Discovery into greatest pain points to target in operational areas	Informing decision making		Priority 1 – Develop a greater understanding of need
Develop proposed target architecture for supporting AI needs	Implementation and Delivery/ Regulatory assurance	NDR	Priority 3 – Enabling Safe and Ethical AI
Discovery and delivery of cross sector AI implementation	Implementation and Delivery		Priority 3 – Enabling Safe and Ethical AI



## Annex

### AI Commission for Health and Social Care Wales

#### Terms of Reference

To note, this is currently under review, to reflect the new team in the Life Science Hub, and the need to ensure appropriate stakeholders are engaged.

<b>Document Version</b>	<b>Final</b>
<b>Status</b>	<b>Approved</b>

<b>Document Author:</b>	Gareth Ashman
<b>Approved by</b>	Ai Commission for Health and Social Care – Mike Emery Chair
<b>Date Approved:</b>	31 October 2023



Contents	
<u>DOCUMENT HISTORY</u> .....	10
<u>REVISION HISTORY</u>	10
<u>AUTHORISATION</u>	10
<u>TERMS OF REFERENCE</u> .....	10
<u>PURPOSE OF THE COMMISSION</u>	11
<u>AIMS AND AMBITIONS</u>	11
<u>Priority 1: Developing a deeper understanding of AI needs across the Health and Social Care Sector in Wales</u> .....	12
<u>Priority 2: Mapping the current ecosystem.</u> .....	12
<u>Priority 3: Enabling Safe and Ethical AI</u> .....	13
<u>SCOPE</u>	13
<u>MEMBERSHIP</u>	14
<u>CHAIRPERSON AND SECRETARIAT</u>	15
<u>DURATION AND FREQUENCY</u>	15
<u>DECISION MAKING</u>	15
<u>APPENDIX A – COMMISSION OUTLINE AGENDA</u>	17
<u>APPENDIX B - COMMISSION MEMBERS &amp; ATTENDEES</u>	18
<u>Members</u>	18
<u>Attendees and deputies</u>	18

## DOCUMENT HISTORY

### REVISION HISTORY

Date	Version	Author	Revision Summary
22/07/2023	0.1	Gareth Ashman	Initial draft
02/08/2023	0.2	Gareth Ashman	Review by AI working group
23/08/2023	0.3	Gareth Ashman	Agreed by AI working Group
29/08/2023	0.4	Gareth Ashman	Reviewed by AI Commission
26/09/2023	1.0	Gareth Ashman	Agreed subject to final review - Commission to include assurance that Health and Social care have parity across the work and there is a clear prioritization.
31/10/2023	1.1	Gareth Ashman	Terms of Reference agreed and Aims and Ambitions updated. Tor agreed subject to regular review in line with the needs and priorities of NHS Wales

### AUTHORISATION

The signing of this document indicates acceptance of its contents.

<b>Author's Name</b>	Gareth Ashman - AI Policy lead, Health and Social Care, Welsh Government
<b>Authoriser's name</b>	Mike Emery - Chief Digital Officer, NHS Wales

### TERMS OF REFERENCE

This document defines the Terms of Reference by which the AI Commission for Health and Social Care in Wales will function, hereafter referred to as 'The Commission'.

This document has been prepared by the Welsh Government Health and Social Care Policy Lead for Artificial Intelligence, acting in the role of Commission Secretariat. It will be reviewed by the Chair of the Commission and Chief Digital Officer for NHS Wales, hereafter referred to as 'The Chair'. The document will be approved by the Commission membership.



## PURPOSE OF THE COMMISSION

The Commission was developed in response to the request from the Chief Digital and Innovation Officer for NHS Wales to the chairs of PHW, HEIW and DHCW for the three organisations to work collaboratively to establish an executive oversight and advisory group focussed on ethical AI regulation and adoption.

The Commission will lead the development and continuous review of a safe, responsible, and ethical environment for the use of AI within the Health and Social Care sector in Wales. It will draw on expertise, insight, and authority from across Health and Social Care, and wider public sector to jointly understand, document and address the needs of staff, patients, and the public regarding AI adoption.

The Commission will identify and draw on best practice from national and international partners while developing relationships and working collaboratively with wider public sector partners in Wales, industry, academia and the third sector.

The Commission will also be asked to consider how best to enable a positive environment for the adoption of AI technologies. Where appropriate, considering how review of existing practices and procedures can be undertaken to facilitate a better overall environment for the development, procurement, testing and benefits analysis of AI solutions in Health and Social Care.

Members will work collaboratively to decide on the direction of travel for safe and ethical AI adoption and work with their own institutions and wider partners to ensure these decisions are adopted.

The Commission will be supported by the Health and Social Care AI Working Group. The Working Group has been established to drive forward the vision for AI in health and social care, to improve patient outcomes and make the health and social care system more efficient, by responding to the recommendations in the Landscape Review of AI in Health and Social Care in Wales, 2023 - developed by Public Health Wales and the AI Working Group.

The Working Group will ensure that the recommendations of the Landscape Review are prioritised, scoped, planned, and implemented or incorporated as appropriate into the workplans, policies and strategies of the AI ecosystem partners following the wider strategic advice and guidance of the AI Commission.

## AIMS AND AMBITIONS

The Landscape Review provides a core basis on which to drive Commission activity, supported by subsequent work in policy development, academic review, risk analysis of strategic issues, and patient experience. Building on this analysis the Commission will adopt 3 core priorities and associated objectives on which to base its work. At the outset the Commission's priorities can be summarised as:



### Priority 1: Developing a deeper understanding of AI needs across the Health and Social Care Sector in Wales

There is a need to improve organisational understand of the requirements that exist across the Health and Social Care sector in Wales so that we are using AI as a tool to solve real word problems and improve the overall delivery of Health and Social Care. Warthin this the Commission will answer key questions:

1. What barriers are in place, preventing greater adoption of effective, ethical AI?
2. What can be done to reduce or remove these barriers.
3. What are the highest priority areas of the sector that could benefit from joined up approach to AI implementation?

### Priority 2: Mapping the current ecosystem.

Beyond specific AI projects there is a need to understand and evidence the wider digital ecosystem across Wales that can support and enable the delivery of ethical AI. This includes interest groups, skills development, technical capability and links with higher education and staff unions. This work will identify opportunities for joint working and alignment with national programs, opportunities for further engagement with Research and industry.

#### Specific Aims:

1. Develop a stakeholder map ensuring groups from across Health and Social Care are represented equally as well as engaging cross sector.
2. Develop a communications plan to build a clear confidence in the work of the Commission and growing use of AI across the sector.
3. Map the AI landscape in Wales and the UK – including an understanding of current AI focussed work and implementations across organisations.



### Priority 3: Enabling Safe and Ethical AI

Ensuring the safe and ethical adoption of AI is core to the purpose of this group. The Working Group and Commission will work collaboratively across the sector and with international partners to identify best practice and solutions to meet identified needs and look to implement in Welsh Health and Social Care using evidence led approaches.

#### Specific Aims:

1. Review AI and Digital Regulations Service offering and adopt or adapt it for use in Wales.
2. Review the Algorithmic Transparency Standard and ethical frameworks and adopt / adapt for Wales.

#### SCOPE

The Commission's overarching role will be to act in an advisory, support and governance capacity as the executive oversight group responsible for reviewing, commenting on, and endorsing, where appropriate, regulatory, best practice, organisational and development opportunities. This role will work in support of wider NHS Wales senior leadership, the NHS Executive and Ministers.

This includes but is not limited to the activities identified in the 'Aims and Ambitions' section of this terms of reference document and any proposed regulatory, enabling, best practice or organisational introductions/changes proposed by Welsh Government, NHS Executive or wider health and social care bodies, related to the adoption of AI across health and social care in Wales. Within this role the Commission will:

- Represent their own organisations and sectors within the wider Health and Social Care sector and speak with authority when commenting on issues brought to it for consideration.
- Support the work of the Chief Digital Officer for NHS Health and Social Care in Wales in their role overseeing the development of digital services to the benefit of patients and staff.
- Provide constructive challenge and raise risks associated with AI adoption.
- Encourage the joint working of NHS Health and Social Care organisations towards a common set of standards and goals associated with AI adoption including those associated with the wider public sector.
- Promote an active understanding of user needs across their organisations and areas of influence, and voice this need accordingly.
-



- Comment on any proposed UK regulatory introductions and changes and provide appropriate advice to the Minister for Health and Social Care.
- Comment on any relevant proposed best practice developed either a UK, Welsh or sector level and appropriate advice to the Minister for Health and Social Care.

The Commission will also act to promote the appropriate use of AI, both in members own organisations and in the wider health and social care sector. This includes a focus on the operational development of systems and organisations to be able to effectively adopt ethical AI solutions where appropriate.

## ACTIVITY

- Produce a roadmap and timescale for the adoption of AI supportive regulation, standards, and actions – including any national initiatives towards improving the AI environment - both through the end of financial year 2023/24 and beyond.
- Track progress against this roadmap, seeking assurances from relevant sectoral bodies and intervening where required.
- Identify, track, regularly review and proactively manage the core risks and issues associated with AI development and adoption across Health and Social Care in Wales,
- Seek out and maintain a wider understanding of the context of AI use across wider sectors to inform decision making.
- Regularly communicate the Commission’s work to home organisations and wider partners, patients, and the public.
- Recruit several independent members to sit on the Commission. This may include members from but aren’t limited to, academia, industry and workforce, clinical and technical professions, public sector representation from outside Wales.

## MEMBERSHIP

The Commission will include membership from across the Health and Social Care ecosystem in Wales. Core membership will include representation from:

- Welsh Government



- Public Health Wales
- Health Education and Improvement Wales
- Digital Health and Care Wales
- Social Care Wales
- Welsh Local Government Association
- The Life Sciences Hub
- The Centre for Digital Public Services
- Welsh Health Boards

In addition, the Commission will request the membership of independent expert members to ensure that there is appropriate challenge and representation. This membership will be discussed at the first meeting of the Commission.

A detailed list of Commission members can be found in Appendix B. To maintain strong representation in the Commission, members will make a commitment to attend all meetings. If a member is unable to attend, they should nominate a named deputy who will have the delegated authority to speak on their behalf.

#### CHAIRPERSON AND SECRETARIAT

The Commission will be provisionally chaired by Mike Emery as Chief Digital Officer for Health and Social Care. The permanent chair for the group will be discussed at its first meeting.

The role of Commission Secretariat will be filled in the interim by the Welsh Government Lead for AI Policy in Health and Social Care.

#### DURATION AND FREQUENCY

The AI Commission for Health and Social Care will be established by the end of August 2023 and operate for at least the period August 2023 – March 2024.

The Commission will meet monthly starting from starting from the 29 August 2023. The Commission can jointly agree to convene more frequent meetings if required.

#### DECISION MAKING

The Commission will provide guidance on the most effective, ethical, and appropriate course of action when discussing matters relating to AI Development and adoption within Wales. The Chief Digital Officer for Health and Social Care will ultimately advise the Minister for Health and Social Care on any matters of national importance based on the work of the AI Commission. The Minister will ultimately be responsible for decision making at a national level.

Welsh Government officials and the AI working group will be responsible for identifying areas of national importance for consideration by the Commission.



Commission members and the AI Working Group may also identify and nominate matters of importance which the Commission will have an interest in discussing.

The Commission will provide clear and concise direction and guidance to the cross health and social care AI Working Group. The working group in turn will support and help action the decisions of the Commission.

The Commission will act in a strategic advisory and support for specific projects that influence AI development and adoption on a national scale. This may not include individual AI implementation projects led by health boards or other bodies, but such projects should be aware of and influenced by the decision making and guidance of the Commission.

Any matters that require decision, for instance a particular direction for advice to The Chief Digital Officer, will be sought on a consensus basis. If a consensus cannot be reached, decision making will be sought on a simple majority basis.

To ensure protection from underrepresentation in decision making for matters of significance, the Commission will enforce a minimum representation (quorum) to be decided by the Chair.

Attendees should come to meetings prepared and empowered to express views and make decisions on behalf of the area that they represent. To support members in this work, initial briefing papers will be limited to 2 pages unless more detail is specifically requested.



GIG  
CYMRU  
NHS  
WALES

Iechyd Cyhoeddus  
Cymru  
Public Health  
Wales

## APPENDIX A – COMISSION OUTLINE AGENDA

1. Welcome and Apologies
2. Minutes of last meeting - Decisions and Actions
3. Actions Log
4. Submitted Agenda Items
5. Any Other Business

## APPENDIX B - COMMISSION MEMBERS & ATTENDEES

### Members

Name	Organization	Role
Mike Emery	NHS Wales – Chief Digital Officer	Chair
Sue Evans	Chief Executive – Social Care Wales	Interim Chair
Sian Richards	HEIW – Director of Digital Development	Member
Ifan Evans	DHCW – Executive Director of Strategy	Member
Iain Bell	PHW – National Director of Public Health Data, Knowledge and Research	Member
Cari-Anne Quinn	Life Sciences Hub – Chief Executive Officer	Member
Jack Rigby	CDPS – Head of Technology	Member
Susan Myles	Health Technology Wales - Director	Member
Lindsey Phillips	WLGA – Interim Chief Digital Officer	Member
Sarah McCarty	Social Care Wales – Director of Improvement and Development	Member
Glyn Jones	Welsh Government – Chief Digital Officer	Member
Delia Ripley	Welsh Government - Deputy Chief Scientific Advisor	Member
James Calvert	Medical Director - Aneurin Bevan Health Board	Member
Huw Thomas	Finance Director - Hywel Dda Health Board	Member
Nick Elliot	PHW - Non-Executive Director: Data and Digital	Member
Matt Jones	Chair – Computer Science, Swansea University	Member
Chris D.V. Jones	Chair – Health Education and Improvement Wales	Member
Rowan Gardner	Independent member - DHCW	Member
Chris Hopkins	Consultant Clinical Scientist, Head of the Tritech Institute	Member

### Attendees and deputies

Name	Organization	Role
Gareth Ashman	Welsh Government	Attendee – Interim Secretariat
Mike Thomas	Welsh Government	Attendee
Bryn Harries	DHCW	Attendee
Chris Habberley	DHCW	Attendee
Louisa Nolan	PHW	Attendee
Christopher Rolls	Life Sciences Hub	Attendee



GIG  
CYMRU  
NHS  
WALES

Iechyd Cyhoeddus  
Cymru  
Public Health  
Wales

Craig Barker	HEIW	Attendee
David Jarrom	Health Technology Wales	Attendee